		1
1		
2		
3		
4		PUBLIC HEARING
5		PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 18-A OF THE NEW
6		YORK GENERAL MUNICIPAL LAW
7	R	RE: GENESEE COUNTY INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY D/B/A GENESEE COUNTY
8	ECONO	OMIC DEVELOPMENT CENTER AND PROJECT RAMPART, LLC GENESEE COUNTY, NEW YORK
9		
10		
11		
12	LOCATION:	Town of Alabama Fire Hall,
13		2230 Judge Road,
14		Alabama, New York 14013
15		
16	DATE:	February 3, 2025
17	TIME:	2:00 p.m.
18		
19		
20	REPORTED BY:	SUZANNE SAEED TACKER, Certified Court Reporter
21		FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES
22		21 Woodcrest Drive
23		Batavia, New York 14020
24		
25	APPEARAN	NCES:
_	I	

		2
1	Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025	
2	MARK MASSE, HEARING MODERATOR,	
3	99 MedTech Drive,	
4	Batavia, New York.	
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING MODERATOR: Good afternoon. I have 2 o'clock. I think we'd like to call the public hearing to order. My name is Mark Masse. I am President, CEO of the Genesee County Economic Development Center. I'd like to thank everyone for coming out today for these three public hearings on the proposed benefits for these projects. The purpose of these public hearings is to solicit comments and feedback about the proposed incentives being requested by each project.

These projects are -- some of them are seeking a payment in lieu of taxes, property tax abatement, a sales tax abatement, and a mortgage tax exemption. To be clear, these incentives are not cash that is given to the company, instead, they're an abatement on future taxes that would be owed resulting from the development of the project.

Copies of the applications for financial assistance and economic impact analysis for each project are available on the GCEDC's website. The GCEDC's uniform tax exemption

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

policy is also available on the GCEDC's website.

These public hearings are being broadcast live at the link provided in the public notice for the public hearings. Please sign in on the sign-in sheets if you have not already done so. If you wish to speak, please place an X by your name.

Please note that these public hearings are not a question-and-answer period. Any comments received either written or oral will be compiled and given to the board prior to the board meeting where a final vote on the incentive -- on the proposed incentives will take place. We will start each of the public hearings with a short overview of the proposed projects. When that has been completed, we'll present the proposed incentives requested by each of the companies.

At the end of the presentation, any written comments that were received will be entered into the official record. We'll then call the people who put an X by their

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

name up to the podium in the order that they signed in, which I don't know if it's the order that they've signed in. I have a bunch of sheets, but everybody who placed an X by their name will be given a chance to speak.

Before providing any comments, we ask that each speaker clearly state their name and their address so we can make sure we can accurately reflect it in the record.

Each speaker will be given three minutes to provide their comments. You'll be given notice when you have 30 seconds left to go to your comment period. And Matt Fitzgerald will be given the 32nd notice. If there's time at the end after everyone has spoken, if somebody else wishes to speak who did not sign up, they will be given an opportunity to do so.

So, the first project is project Rampart, LLC. They are looking at a total capital investment of about \$3.3 billion. They would be pledging to create 105 jobs. They would be constructing a 750,000-square-

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

foot data center, and they are estimated to generate a total of \$206 million in local municipal revenue over 20 years.

Now we will move into the public comment period. Again, before making comments, we just ask that each speaker clearly state their name, spell their last name, state of their municipality of residence clearly so we can get it correctly in the record.

If you plan on making the same comments for all three projects, please just state that at one of the hearings. You do not need to come back up at the later hearings. Please, also note that the three projects are mutually exclusive as they seek to acquire overlapping property at the -- on the STAMP site.

Accordingly, the GCEDC board is only considering whether to approve one or none of the projects.

Again, each speaker will have three minutes to make their comments. There will be a warning when you have 30 seconds left and if there's time at the end of the

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

hearing and anyone who did not attend to speak wishes to make a comment will be given an opportunity at that time.

So that being said -- and I do apologize if I mispronounce any names. The first person on my sheet I have here is Madeline Nyblade.

MS. NYBLADE: Hi, I am Dr. Madeline Nyblade, N-Y-B-L-A-D-E. I live in Syracuse, New York, 22 -- 1222 Lancaster Avenue. I'm an Assistant Professor at SUNY ESF. I hold PhD in Earth and Environmental Sciences а with a specialty in hydrology. I'm here today speaking on behalf of myself and not To lend my expertise to this SUNY ESF. question about data centers, my comment applies to all three of the data centers. Ι have reviewed all of the environmental impact assessments and the maps that were provided and looked at the regional hydrology, local hydrology, the soils, and the subsurface geology.

And I want to emphasize that all of these data centers will impact the hydrology

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

of this region. It is upstream from the Tonawanda Seneca Nation lands, the Tonawanda Wildlife Management Area, and the Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge. The runoff from this site and the impacts to the hydrology will have detrimental downstream impacts on all three of these important lands.

It will have impacts to the Tonawanda Seneca Nation, which has sovereign lands. This water will have direct impacts on their habitat, ecosystems, and waterways.

So, first, the data center is in direct hydrologic connection to these downstream wetlands. The whole geology of this area, it once was a historic glacial lake and so there's lots of deposits of clay and silt. Clay is impermeable to water, and so it holds a lot of water at the surface, creating a lot of wetlands.

So, you see these massive wetland complexes in the region, and there's likely extended onto the STAMP lands as well. They have been drained and converted to agricultural lands, but you can still see

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the remnants of the streams and the wetlands on the date proposed data center land, especially if you look at the 2024 Google Earth satellite imagery. You can see the stream courses and the wetlands that were on this data center lands. And I have maps and stuff to submit as part of my comments.

So, you can see that this land is wetland, part of this larger wetland complex, yet none of the proposals take into account the wetlands that will be destroyed as when creating this data center, which will add I think it's for the range 25 to 39 acres of impervious services to this area.

Also, the geologic reports done by STAMP and reviewed, at least in one of the data center reports. Talk extensively about perch water tables.

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds.

MS. NYBLADE: So, perch water tables are water tables that are on top of and higher and closer to the surface because of clay lenses. And so, it's a very wet area and it'll be hard to develop. And none of the

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

reports take into account how they will develop given all of these -- these higher water tables in -- in certain areas and especially during wet seasons. The geological report said that it'll be very difficult to develop in the wet seasons, which will compound all of the impacts that could -- that will flow downstream. Is that my timer? That's okay. So, I just want to say I oppose all three of the data centers.

HEARING MODERATOR: Do you have anything you want to --

MS. NYBLADE: Yeah, I'm -- be -- I'm caught off guard by going first.

HEARING MODERATOR: Next, we have Margaret Wooster.

MS. WOOSTER: This letter that I'm going to read is from the allies of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation, the Western New York Environmental Alliance and 57 --

HEARING MODERATOR: (Inaudible).

MS. WOOSTER: Pardon?

HEARING MODERATOR: You have to state your name.

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 2 MS. WOOSTER: Oh, Margaret Wooster, W-O-3 O-S-T-E-R. 4 HEARING MODERATOR: And your municipality 5 where you reside. 6 MS. WOOSTER: Buffalo, New York. So, 7 this letter is from the allies of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation, the Western New 8 9 York Environmental Alliance, and 57 other 10 environmental, faith, human rights, and 11 govern -- good governance groups. And it 12 addresses the investment groups behind 13 Project Rampart specific financial _ _ 14 specifically financial and incentives 15 proposed by the GEC -- the GECDC were not 16 publicly shared until mid-afternoon last 17 Friday, January 31. The same deadline set for submitting written comments. 18 So, there 19 is more to be said about the subsidies. 20 This is addressed to the development 21 consortium behind project Rampart. Dear Mr. 22 Wesco and Kilt and Smith, we write as 23 concerned allies of the Tonawanda Seneca 24 Nation and residents of Western New York,

who deeply value our region's ecological and

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

cultural heritage, PRP's proposal to build a data center code-named Potentia Rampart at the science at the STAMP in Alabama, New York is not aligned with either New York State or international commitments to environmental sustainability, social responsibility, and long term stewardship.

We urge you to withdraw your application to site a data center at STAMP and join us in safeguarding this remarkable place for future generations. UN Sustainable Development Goals include clean water, affordable clean energy, responsible consumption and climate action. Yet the proposed project Rampart Data Center actually undermines these goals. The STAMP site lies at the heart of a vast wetlands complex connected to the Tonawanda Wildlife Management area, Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge, and Tonawanda Seneca Nation Reservation territory.

In fact, the entirety of STAMP lies within the unseated homelands of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation. These protected

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

lands provide critical ecological benefits like carbon sequestration, flood mitigation, habitat preservation, industrial runoff, hydrological disruptions, and heated water discharge from a data center would devastate these fragile ecosystems.

Data centers are known for their massive energy demands and Project Rampart is no exception. It demands -- its demand for 200 megawatts of electricity per year would strain the regional energy systems undermine affordability and sustainability. Project Ramparts usage of up to 800,000 gallons of water per day. Squanderers our precious regional fresh water and the project's emissions of 1,471,000 tons of carbon dioxide, 441 tons of nitrogen dioxide and 88 tons of hazardous air pollutants per year are completely out of line.

With 2019 Climate Leadership and Community Protection Goals and the New York State Environmental Siting Law and move our state in the direction of further environmental injustice. Putting a data

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 2 center at STAMP also contradicts. Almost 3 there. So, New York State and National 30 4 by 30 initiatives and the Western New York 5 Wildlife Conservation Strategy. I have a 6 copy or two of this letter with all the 7 names of the signatories to this letter. 8 It's a very impressive list and thank you very much. 9 10 HEARING MODERATOR: Do we have a copy of 11 that? 12 MS. WOOSTER: I will give you this copy. HEARING MODERATOR: Thank you very much. 13 14 Joseph O'Malley. 15 MS. O'MALLEY: Hello. My name is Joseph 16 O'Malley. My municipality is Buffalo, New 17 But for this part of the hearing, I York. 18 will be reading from a statement by John 19 Whitney of the Western New York 20 Environmental Alliance. On behalf of the 21 Western New York Environmental Alliance and 22 in solidarity with the allies of the 23 Tonawanda Seneca Nation and other groups and 24 individuals, I am writing to express our 25 strong opposition to the proposed financial

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

incentives being offered and to support the construction -- offered to support this construction and operation of the Potentia, Rampart, and Double Reed computer data centers in the GCEDC STAMP site in Genesee County, New York.

Or to any other data centers of cryptocurrency, "Mines associated an associated infrastructure for that matter." This proposal raises significant environmental and financial concerns. Among our objections is the fact that the amount of the incentives has not been disclosed and that these public fund incentives would be on top of the massive incentives that have already been directed toward the acquisition and development of this most inappropriately located set of speculative, high tech, high environmental impact facilities.

The environmental impacts of the STAMP development and these new proposals cannot be overstated. The GCEDC STAMP site is situated in an area with deep cultural and ecological significance central to Western

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

New York's heritage, including that of the Haudenosaunee people and the Tonawanda Seneca Nation. The region is part of the ancestral and contemporary territory of the Haudenosaunee Iroquois and is physically, biologically, hydrologically, and geomorphological interconnected with a system of national and state wildlife refuges totaling over 20,000 acres.

These refuges are crucial to the eastern wild way, an ecological corridor extending from Mexico to Maine, which aims to restore and preserve wildlife habitats across the vast landscape, including -- introducing large-scale data centers threatens to disrupt these delicate ecosystems leading to habitat destruction, increased pollution, and a substantial carbon footprint in direct conflict with New York's CLCPA and 30 by 30 goals. Moreover, the financial implications of offering incentives for such projects warrant scrutiny.

While proponents may argue that data centers bring economic growth, which isn't

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

necessarily true, they often do so at hidden costs. Data centers require enormous amounts of energy. Energy not available at this location, but what -- which must be brought to the site through transmission lines that are almost certainly inadequate Putting additional strain on local and regional infrastructure. The long-term financial burden of maintaining these facilities coupled with the potential environmental remediation costs could outweigh the short-term benefit of the economic incentives.

Public funds should not be used to incentivize these uncertain benefits and not without first conducting an independent economic analysis of the cost and benefits. Additionally, the influx of these centers might not significantly boost local employment as data centers typically offer limited job opportunities compared to other industries.

It's also not at all clear that the rapid advances in technology will not make

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

these massive energies and cooling waterdemanding structures obsolete within a short period of time.

We are already hearing about those innovations. These massive facilities could be obsolete in a matter of a few years.

In light of these concerns, we urge you to abandon any of the financial incentives being proposed for the construction and operation of data centers in the GCEDC STAMP site. The preservation of our cultural and natural heritage combined with prudent financial planning should take precedence over shortsighted development projects that pose long-term risks and harmful and or wasteful cut impacts.

Finally, we believe a new set of public hearings must be held to address the many changes in STAMP since it was first proposed and approved. We trust that you will consider these concerns and act in the best interest of our community and environment. Sincerely, John Whitney, Chairperson of the Western New York Environmental Alliance.

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING MODERATOR: Thank you.

MS. O'MALLEY: I shouldn't take this. This isn't mine.

HEARING MODERATOR: Kurt Stange.

MR. STANGE: Hi, my name is Kurt Stange, and I'm a settler ally who is the family physician of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation. I'm also a public health specialist and for public health reasons, among many others are strongly opposed to proposing set-up for Project Potentia, Project Rampart, and Project Double Reed. These three projects all have the nerve to propose setting up immediately at the border of the Tonawanda Seneca nation and its big woods. All three projects estimate they burn at least 60,000 gallons of diesel fuel per year.

They all expect to emit at least 500 tons of climate-warming carbon dioxide per year. Because the nation would be closest to pollution sources, it would be illegal for GCEDC to approve any of these projects per the Environmental Justice Siting law and New York's climate law, the CLCPA. In

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

addition to air pollution, the nation's health would suffer from a constant jet engine, like 50 to 90 decibel noise coming from any of these three projects. There's extensive documentation of people living near data centers at much higher rates of stress, anxiety, insomnia, headaches, cognitive impairment, hearing loss, and ringing in ears as a result. Just talk to people in North Tonawanda. Over time, this noise exposure even causes high blood pressure and heart disease per the World Health Organization.

Noise, air light pollution would also drive wildlife away from the adjacent big woods. Yet this is the nation's main site for hunting and these projects would therefore threaten its food security.

Further, potentially contaminated surface water flows at STAMP from east to west and therefore into the nation. Just imagine the contamination of their well water with diesel fuel spills and those from untreated sewer water. What about the

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

threat of a data center fire burning down their big woods and their houses? These risks and harms also apply to STAMPs other neighbors outside the nation.

Meanwhile, others will be affected as far away as the mouth of Oak Orchard River. Just think about fishermen sitting idle with empty poles because of the harmful effects of super-heated data centers. Sewer water spiced up with industrial toxins.

In medicine we study how parasites suck up the nutrients or resources while harming them. Well, that's exactly what these data centers are. Parasitic centers that would suck up an immense amount of the drinking water of Niagara or lean Erie and Genesee County residents. They would also steal a huge amount of their energy in exchange for a barrage of contamination.

What's more? Hardly any jobs would be offered to local residents and expansion of AI is predicted to result in massive job loss for blue-collar workers. This would mean millions of dollars in taxpayer

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

subsidies, funding one to three parasitic centers that would actually harm taxpayers and take away their jobs. GCEDC must reject the applications of all three centers, but they won't because they just don't care about the communities.

Therefore, it's time to force their hand in doing so. Justice as North Tonawanda banned new parasitic centers, all other communities locally would be wise to do the same.

HEARING MODERATOR: Diane Ciurczak.

MS. CIURCZAK: My name is Diane Ciurczak. I am on the executive committee of the Niagara Group for the Sierra Club. And today -- and I live in Buffalo, New York. Today I'm speaking on behalf of the roughly 37,000 members of the Atlantic Chapter of the Sierra Club and to oppose any funding for any data centers, the Potential Holdings or the Hydro Scale, which is the Hydro Scale, or the Rampart, or the Double Reed. There should be no data center here at STAMP. We oppose the data centers on both

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

procedural and on substantive grounds. Data centers around the country are notoriously dirty and noisy consumers. A vast amount of electricity which are straining Electric Grids, emitting large volumes of greenhouse gas pollution and undermining our country's ability to transition away from fossil fuels.

Our Landmark 2019 Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act has specific goals for the reduction of carbon emissions, and this project would undermine those goals. The law requires that all agencies in New York State consider what effect their projects will have on our ability to meet our goals. This undermines the goals.

Project Potentia would require 195 megawatts of electricity per year from NYPA. This is enough to power about 32,000 homes. And on the other hand, it would use an estimated 1,285,000 gallons of diesel fuel per year. That would put about 14,622 tons of carbon dioxide into the air, as well as other pollutants. The largest facility

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that's proposed is the project double-read that would require 250 megawatts of electricity diverting -- enough to power 40,000 homes. All of this is in -- in nonconformity with our CLCPA.

Based upon other -- the experience of other communities around the country, they -- including Niagara Falls and North Tonawanda, which enacted a moratorium on crypto mining currency because of the -- it affected the health and wellbeing of its citizens. There was a moratorium. This would've caused noise pollution that would also disrupt the lives of the people who are living here. And --

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds.

MS. CIURCZAK: Okay. Finally, the manner in which this hearing was organized and the papers that have been filed publicly by the GCECDC are not in conformity with the general municipal law.

First of all, this agency doesn't have the authority or the powers to entertain a data center. It doesn't fall within the

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

requirements or the authorities of Section 852 or 858. It's -- the manner in which it was noticed, did not meet with the law -not sufficient.

The public is not given sufficient notice. It wasn't published properly. It doesn't contain the information about the money that is being offered, the incentives that are being offered.

Late on Friday, apparently, additional papers were filed. Those are also not in conformity with the general municipal law. And the assessment or the analysis that appears to have been filed on Friday is not in conformity with the requirement to assess the costs and benefits.

So, in general, we object to all three data centers. They're not in compliance with the CLCPA, with the general municipal law, or with the citing law to protect disadvantaged communities, which is both in the CLCPA and a standalone law.

> HEARING MODERATOR: Thank you. MS. CIURCZAK: Thank you.

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING MODERATOR: Oh, sorry. Barbara Jonathan.

MS. JONATHAN: (Inaudible). Fellow residence of Genesee County and my neighbors in Alabama, it's good to see you all here today, and I stress for today. Everyone so far has stood up and spoken about the risks associated with these data centers. Т myself live behind Big Woods, the Big Woods is my closest neighbor. I have a cousin who is six years old and in 20 years, I'm not going to be here, but she's going to be here. What are the risks to her? Her brothers, her sisters. What about your children, your grandchildren?

My ancestors reside on the Tonawanda Seneca Nation, that land there is all, all we have left and the perks that are being offered to -- in exchange for these data centers, is it really worth it? When you think about the dangers that are posed to our health when we start failing, where are these people who operate these data centers? Where are they going to be? Are they going

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 to really give a damn about you or I? Μv neighborhood is threatened? How about Thank you. My name is Barbara yours? I reside on Tonawanda Seneca Jonathan. Nations. HEARING MODERATOR: Thank you. Sarah Howard. MS. HOWARD: Sarah Howard, H-O-W-A-R-D. live in Syracuse, New York. You don't Ι need my street address. I live in Syracuse on the unseated homelands of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation. And I have the honor of working for the Tonawanda Seneca Nation on whose own unseated homelands the entirety of the WNY stamp mega industrial site, including the parcel being considered as a site for Projects Rampart, Potentia, or Double Reed is located.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I'm here to comment on the requested financial incentives of \$218,960,000 in sales tax exemptions and \$19,950,000 in mortgage tax exemptions to Project Rampart. A proposed data center being advanced by the real estate investment firm PRP REI.

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Vehemently opposed those incentives as I oppose all three of the financial incentive packages and let's call them what they are, which is taxpayer monies requested by these data center developers.

However, because GCEDC did not post the relevant documents on their website until midday Friday, January 31st, which is one business day before these sham public hearings, and at the same time as GCEDCs deadline for the submission of written online comments, I am not going to comment in substance on the detail of these incentives.

Instead of commenting on the incentives, I'm going to highlight some aspects of Project Rampart's environmental assessment form, that's an EAF, that render whatever company is actually behind this application. And that's right. GCEDC has repeatedly refused to disclose the identities of the companies that would actually be running these data centers. They could be Google, or Meta, or Bitcoin mining operation that

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

render these particularly unfit recipients of the \$238,910,000 in taxpayer dollars that they have the gall to request.

Before I do that though, I want to take few seconds to remind everyone that the а reason we're here is that GCEDC was forced to hold public hearings pursuant to Article 859-(a) of the General Municipal Law, which at its most basic level requires an assessment of the public benefits of any development project that is requesting taxpayer subsidies. Let me repeat. We're here to assess the public benefits of Rampart, Potentia, and Double Reed in relation to the hundreds of millions that each one is requesting.

So, as I stated, the backers of Project Rampart are PRP REI Global Real Estate Investment Firm. The primary contact for PRPREI is Tom Wasco, a name that may be familiar to those of you who read the local newspapers.

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds. MS. HOWARD: In fall 2023, Tom taped his

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

company's meetings with GCEDC and then sent the tapes to local media along with accusations that GCEDC was unfavorably favoring project Hydro Scale, now called Potentia.

For the record, I actually appreciated this move. Tom's ethical, questionable -ethically questionable and aggressive tactics brought a lot of important information to light.

And like Tom, I also feel that GCEDC has utterly failed to carry out a fair and transparent process with respect to the data center applicants or any other aspect of STAMP.

However, this is where Tom and I part ways because I absolutely do not believe that the development of Project Rampart would produce any iota of public benefit and thus is unworthy of 1 cent of public money.

Project Rampart would feature a 40-foothigh single-story structure totaling 750,000 square feet. For scale, we are talking about a building that would be roughly the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

equivalent to 13 football fields, a massive building, especially in the middle of what is currently a rural agricultural community. This building would only produce 105 jobs, meaning that ramparts requested incentives translate to \$2,275,333 per job. Rampart would require 200 megawatts of electricity per year, which we've already heard is roughly enough to power about 32,000 homes.

So, I have a lot of critiques of those numbers, but at least they're fairly straightforward. No funny business. I'm going to keep talking now.

We get into the numbers that raise many, many questions, which Mark has already informed us. He does not plan to answer because this is the time for public comment, not question and answer, but we can still pose the questions publicly, even if Mark and representatives of each data center developer choose not to answer -- answer them in this public forum. That silence is an in and of itself an answer to the question of whether or not these entities

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

deserve our trust, which is no.

As you know, Mark, each applicant submitted two EAFs, an initial version and a revision. The revised EAFs in associated materials differ in significant ways from the original EAX and contain numerous internal contradictions as well as certain claims that appear baseless.

HEARING MODERATOR: We're happy to leave the public here --

MS. HOWARD: Here are a few of the most disturbing differences in Rampart's documents. The original application for Project Rampart submitted on October 15th, 2024 and --

HEARING MODERATOR: Excuse me. Again, we're happy to leave the record open for written comments to go further, because --

MS. HOWARD: I'm going to keep speaking. Three minutes is an appropriate amount of time in which to brush your teeth, not comment on projects that are asking for hundreds of millions of in public. I'm going to keep speaking. The original application

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

for Project Ramparts submitted on October 15th, 2024, indicated a need for 800,000 gallons of water per day. That's a lot of water. 292 million gallons per year to be precise or roughly 442 Olympic swimming pools worth.

And would they be doing something useful with that water? Something of benefit to the public? No, they would be using that water to cool super-heated computing equipment. In case you don't know, a little problem with data centers is that their equipment gets very, very hot. Most data centers depend on vast quantities of water to heat down their equipment and protect -prevent short-circuiting electrical fires or explosions.

So, know the 292 million gallons wouldn't be used in service of benefits to the public. Rather, it would be used for Bitcoin mining or generative AI or something equally useless and wasteful of our precious fresh water.

Apparently, someone told PRP REI that

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

using all that water wasn't a great look because the revised EAF submitted on December 31st, 2024, states that the project needs no water whatsoever for cooling and just 3,675 gallons for sanitary sewer. The new application references something called a closed loop system, which conveniently eliminates the need for hundreds of millions of gallons of water to cool Rampart's equipment.

However, the new application also now includes a nearly eight-acre retention pond that would hold 10 million gallons of water. That's an awful lot of storm water.

Together, the size of the retention ponds references to the closed-loop system and the general lack of information about heated water discharge. A well-known environmental impact of many data centers suggests that Rampart's impoundment ponds may be intended to serve more of a cooling function that a storm water retention function.

This usage seems particularly likely

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

given that Rampart's revised, EAF does acknowledge the intent to use adjacent wetlands and water lands for the express purpose of dealing with storm water runoff. Runoff which will carry salts, traces of vehicular fluid and other contaminants directly onto the Tonawanda Seneca Nation reservation territory with potentially serious impacts on nation waterways. And that's not even addressing the harms of thermal pollution.

HEARING MODERATOR: Excuse me, just for one second.

MS. HOWARD: Mm-hmm (affirmative.)

HEARING MODERATOR: We appreciate your comments. There's a lot of people who want to speak here today. We're more than happy to take your letter in to make it recorded, the public record.

MS. HOWARD: Mm-hmm (affirmative.).

HEARING MODERATOR: And in light of the comments, we will extend the written comment period to 5 o'clock on Thursday, if people wish to submit more comments. At this point

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

36 Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 2 in time, I would really like it, if you 3 wouldn't mind handing us your letter, we'll 4 put it into the record and we can move on to 5 the next person to speak, please. 6 MS. HOWARD: I'm going to hold on to it 7 and keep on reading in the next hour. Thank 8 you. 9 HEARING MODERATOR: I'm having a hard 10 time reading this name, so again, apologize. 11 Is it Maggie Catlin? 12 MR. CATLIN: Catlin. Can you hear me all 13 right? Okay. I just have this written comment that I'd like to pass on. 14 15 HEARING MODERATOR: Just state your name, 16 please. 17 MR. CATLIN: I'm Maggie Catlin. HEARING MODERATOR: And where you live. 18 19 MS. CATLIN: Buffalo. 20 HEARING MODERATOR: Buffalo. Thank you. 21 MR. CATLIN: This is from a friend of 22 mine, George (inaudible). I'm writing to 23 comment about the proposed financial 24 incentives being offered by GCEDC to 25 projects Potentia, Rampart, and Double Reed.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The STAMP location is an area close to the state's largest federal wildlife refuge in the Tonawanda Seneca Nation. Any disruptive industry, you will have a negative impact on both.

Additionally, any ways from a data center going into Orleans County will impact the river systems that ultimately empty into Lake Ontario.

Orleans County has seen a growing tourism industry based on fishing in the river system and into the lake. The potential negative impact of the data center would not be limited to the immediate area. Hearings that specifically address the impact of the data center on the area should be scheduled as an immediate follow-up to the hearings of February 3rd.

The people of nearby Somerset, Niagara County have experience with data centers located on the grounds of a full former coal-fired power plant. The data center is expanding while this county, rather than fully addressing the residents issues of

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

noise.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Here's a quote from a Lockport Sun Journal, December 22nd, 2024. "Cooling in buildings one and two is by fans and unmuted. They generate roughly 85 decibels." Just as an aside OSHA's level for safe workplace exposure is 80 decibels. Buildings three and four are cooled with static venting, which is said to be less noisy. Even so homeowners one to two miles away-- to claim they can hear Lake Mariner at work and they objected strongly to its expansion.

Tara Wolfs, John Mariela, said in October that the company had several noise studies done on the property. The results showed noise level is below the four dibbles listed as the town's noise ordinance.

The potential negative impacts for residents and wildlife made it clear that no data center or should be encouraged to locate the STAMP campus. I've got a little bit more time, so I'd just like to say like, this is one of like the few natural areas,

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

like remaining in like this region of the state. And it seems ridiculous to throw her away for what, you know?

If you look at the proposal, right? Like, not, not what's actually going to result from these, but like the actual -like the best-case scenario, right? What the company is trying to sell is going to happen. There's no value there, right? Like, I don't -- like what -- it's just so obviously like provides nothing to the community and we're supposed to be commenting on conflicts of interest. I don't know how you accept this if you don't have a conflict of interest. I did --

HEARING MODERATOR: Evelyn Wackett.

MS. WACKETT: You got me all emotional. I might not be able to do this.

MALE VOICE 1: Sorry.

MS. WACKETT: It's okay. That's a very emotional topic. Okay. My name is Evelyn Wackett, W-A-C-K-E-T-T. I live in the Black Rock section of Buffalo, New York, along the Niagara River. It's (inaudible) Creek, and

York CLCPA Laws, the Endangered Species Act,

we're here having a party. I want to

the Clean Water Act, Environmental Justice

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

I'm here in opposition to all three of the data centers.

I submitted a (inaudible) to the Buffalo News saying why we don't want data centers here. And the main reason why I'm here and what got me started over two years ago was the short-eared novel. I'm a wildlife rehabber.

This guy right here is what got me involved in this stamp project. I love owls, I love raptors and everything about the STAMP project threatens the endangered short-eared owl, the threatened Northern Harrier hawk, the threatened monarch butterfly, the threatened and endangered bogged turtles. This affects everything we see and we don't see.

Yesterday was World Wetlands Day, and

celebrate the wetlands. I don't want to see

them destroyed. Everything about this goes

against the Treaty of Canandaigua, the New

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Siting. There's more. I'm sure that there's being violated here.

And again, the seen and the unseen, you know, you think about the little creatures in the water that the birds feed on. All of this water connects us all over the place. This affects all of Western New York. The proposed pipeline, 16 miles from Niagara County into Genesee County to draw over 6 million gallons of water a day from the Niagara River, don't Canada have a say in this?

Then we're going to take and we're going to heat it up, add chemicals, and then we're going to dump it into, well, the last plant was Oakfield New York, which goes into Oak Orchard Creek, which runs through the refuge, which ends up in Lake Ontario.

This thing affects all of us here, and we're all connected. One thing fails, we all fail. The bees we lose -- the bees we lose, the flowers, we lose the birds. We can't eat if the bees aren't here.

And to speak out for my friends at the

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Tonawanda Seneca Nation, like I said, I came on here because I wanted to protect the owl because I'm a wildlife rehabber, but I've grown a relationship with the Tonawanda Seneca people, I respect them and their opposition to this. And, you know, to be invited to help protest for this with you people meant so much to me. And I'm trying not to get emotional.

I've got a petition here that I started back in October, we have over 1,056 signatures in opposition to STAMP. I've got them all printed out here. And to finish this, you know, as a little girl growing up, my mom used to bring-here-- me here all the time. It's what taught me to love the land, love the water.

To finish, I'm going to read one comment from the petition, but I'm going to submit them all. "The Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge is a beautiful place, and it borders the Tonawanda Wildlife Management area. More importantly, it borders the Tonawanda Band of Seneca Nation and threatens their

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 2 well water that they use to drink. 3 There have not been proper procedures 4 done as far as how this STAMP project has 5 just appeared." And to me it just appeared. 6 "There is a lot of concrete evidence to 7 show hydrogen can be used, green energy. 8 Anyone who has ever seen these two huge egg-9 ball structures has to wonder how safe it 10 Yes, the wetlands are vital to the is. 11 local ecosystem and threatens one of the 12 Great Lakes, Lake Ontario. 13 This area is such an area of bird and 14 waterfowl migration, and bald eagles live 15 there. And let's speak about the bald 16 eagles, our national bird. We're going to 17 ruin their habitat for this, and like 18 everybody else said before me." It's one of 19 the last little untouched areas we have here 20 in New York State. And part of the 30 by 30, 21 and part of the wild way and the green way, 22 and all these things that we're trying to 23 Thank you. save. HEARING MODERATOR: Kristin Mosher. 24 25 MS. WACKETT: This might've been the

comment I forgot to submit.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING MODERATOR: Oh, thank you.

MS. MOSHER: Hi, my name's Kristin Mosher, M-O-S-H-E-R. I live in Syracuse, New York on the unseated homelands of the Onondaga Nation. I'm a professional wildlife photographer and sound recordist. I'm here speaking on behalf of myself as well as many of you have been up here to speak on behalf of the wildlife. And I completely disagree with these data centers because they're set up to destroy what wildlife is left.

These projects do not belong in an area neighboring the peoples of the Seneca Nation. In addition to the wetland wildlife refuges of John White Wildlife Management Area, Iroquois National Wildlife Management Area, Tonawanda Wildlife Management Area, Oak Orchard Wildlife Management Area, what are you thinking? What is going to be left if you do this? I'm a volunteer working with a team of volunteers to record biological diversity on the Seneca Nation. As part of

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

this project, we have set out microphones to record the wildlife on the nation, which I'm feel so privileged to have been involved with.

I would like -- I would like to share a sampling of these recordings to wake you up to what will be lost. This first recording was made on May 1st, 2024, as an example of the enormous diversity of birds, which utilize the Big Woods, which is home to over a hundred species of birds, many of which are dependent on undisturbed areas to reproduce. Here it goes. I hope you can hear it.

(Recording was played.)

MS. MOSHER: I feel bad cutting them off. The second recording captured in the same forest is the sound of just one truck passing by on a nearby road to go to the STAMP complex.

(Recording was played.)

MS. MOSHER: That's what you'll be hearing, if these three data centers go in -- if any of this continued destruction --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds.

MS. MOSHER: -- continues to happen. The data center would be one of the closest complexes to this exceptional forest. The sound of the trucks will be multiplied by the constant industrial sounds of the center. Noise pollution will not only impact and displace wildlife in the big woods, it will forever destroy the peace and serenity of this sacred land for the people of Tonawanda.

It should also be mentioned that this is a stronghold for the Cerulean Warbler, one of our national species that is of conservation concern and is also endangered in Canada.

I want to play one more recording for you. I know I'm overtime, but this is the sound that they hear in Virginia where there already is a data center built in continuing to do its thing.

(Recording was played.)

MS. MOSHER: It's a low-frequency noise that is always heard in this neighborhood

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

47 Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 2 now. That's what we're in for, if this isn't 3 stopped. And thank you for your time. 4 HEARING MODERATOR: Thank you. Gary 5 Ciurczak? MR. CIURCZAK: Hello everyone. My name 6 7 is Gary Ciurczak, C-I-U-R-C-Z-A-K, in Buffalo, unseated land of the Seneca Nation. 8 9 Thank you for the opportunity to speak here 10 today. Pursuant to General Municipal Law 11 859-(a), I'm speaking out to oppose the proposed financial incentives and the 12 13 development of Project Potentia, Project 14 Rampart, and Project Double Reed, and demand 15 that GCEDC hold a new set of public 16 hearings. I'm a bird watcher who's also a member 17 of the Buffalo Ornithological Society, 18 19 though I'm speaking for myself here today. 20 I enjoy multiple trips to the Iroquois 21 National Wildlife Refuge each year; а 22 wildlife refuge adjacent to STAMP land. Any 23 of these projects will take and use the 24 habitat of the endangered short-eared owl, 25 and the threatened northern harrier.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The proposal to build a gigantic data center adjacent to a protected wildlife area is shocking to me, a person who has spent considerable time in this area. New York and the United States spends untold dollars to restore previously damaged wetlands, streams, rivers, and wild areas that have been degraded by prior misuse and abuse, and a pristine wetland area that shelters endangered birds and other wildlife is under threat of destruction by the GCEDC.

Rather than removing wild corridors and sanctuaries, we should support their expansion. No mitigation plan can ameliorate this destruction.

I would like to leave you with the idea about the size of any of these projects. Many here know the BJ's Club Wholesale Club and Batavia. That one building, which I think we all agree is huge, is about 68,000 square feet according to the papers filed by their agent, the DLC Corporation of Tarrytown.

Each -- any one of these data centers

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

are about 800,000 to 900,000 square feet. Any one of those data centers could hold almost 12 of these BJ's. It would be then filled with computers and the tremendous disruptive noise as we just heard, that will not only be heard by every single person living within several miles, but also all local domestic and wildlife in this area. This would be a loud, disturbing, and unrelenting noise that continues for 24 hours a day, 365 days a year. Please join me in opposing these projects.

HEARING MODERATOR: Katie Rivers.

MS. RIVERS: My name's Katie Rivers. I live -- first of all, my hearts beating so fast. I live at 6540 Crosby Road right down the corner of the STAMP project. We lived there for 30 years, and we've seen it change so much. I have opposed this STAMP project from day one, and I will continue to oppose it.

I -- just from what they've done so far, the smells from the trucks going by and everything, that's disruptive. The deer, if

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

anybody goes down Crosby Road at night, you can see they're in their projects because they don't -- they're used to where they used to be. And it just breaks my heart that things are changing from the original plan from STAMP. And I feel like they're trying to save the big project, so we'll divert to doing the data centers, which are not -- they're not helpful to anybody. They're very hurtful. And my family would be directly impacted along with our whole -don't even know where our people are from Ι our town. Well, they're working to fund the taxpayer money for the projects. That's it. I wish they were here, but it just breaks my heart -- what was that?

FEMALE VOICE 1: That's why they have it on (inaudible).

MS. RIVERS: Right. Well, it just breaks my heart that people don't realize how beneficial nature is to us. And I just -it just breaks my heart. I wish people would wake up to see what's actually going on. And I'm so disheartened by the town

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

R

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

that even took on the economic development coming into the town. It's like you've all been bamboozled. It's like, I can't even imagine that you would think that this would be beneficial to anybody in the town. I have seen zero benefit. I don't know if anybody else has seen any benefit in the town. But it's just very harmful to everyone, the citizens and the wildlife.

And we all know the history of them trying to put the pipeline down through, you know, going down into Medina. I mean -- and they've -- and they have a history of covering things up when they make a mistake. So, to me that tells me that you cannot be trusted. And so, trust is earned, it's not just given freely.

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds.

MS. RIVERS: So, that's all I wanted to say. I don't look forward -- well, I will not, because I know this will not go through, listen to constant ringing 24/7, 365 as it is. I can look in my backyard and see the big white balls that are just

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

sitting there, and I've witnessed all of it. And that's all. I just hope that they will just not -- I oppose it and everybody in the whole county should. So that's it. Thank you.

HEARING MODERATOR: Christine Zinni.

MS. ZINNI: Hello my name is Christine Zinni, Z-I-N-N-I. I live in Batavia, New York, third generation, descendant of an Italian immigrant and Polish immigrant family, and I have great concerns about this STAMP project, and I oppose it. I oppose the Project Rampart, Potentia -- Project Potentia, and project Double Reed for the following reasons:

My father was a lawyer. He was a police attorney for the city of Batavia as were other members of my family, lawyers. And this seems to be a question of informed consent over the years. We've heard one side basically of the story for the last couple years, but we need -- the public needs to hear the other side. I urge you to google data centers, see what comes up, the

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

number of lawsuits across the nation because of noise pollution, because of the ill effects. How is this -- how is that going to affect workers?

Promise of a hundred jobs. How about the lawsuits of workers who have had to endure noise pollution within the centers they're working in? This needs to be considered with that promise of jobs for one thing. And I'll just read parts of my letter here and central focus is that noise pollution. I think we all heard and felt from the sound of the birds, the migratory birds in the area -- in the area from one of the speakers, what this means.

So, I'm here on behalf -- I'm an educator. And I'm here as an ally of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation as a resident, and also, I'm here to speak for nature's rights for the birds and animals in the area that are trying to send a message to us, mm-hmm, (inaudible). The character of this region is at stake. Who decides what the character of the region will be? People living here

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

next to the wildlife refuge?

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 Seconds.

MS. ZINNI: Okay. I'm not going to be able to read everything, but I'll just say I'm entering my article -- my paper in the record. And none of the three data center applicants has conducted a comprehensive, meaningful noise study. Instead, they downplayed or obscure altogether potential noise impacts.

Again, go to your computer, check and see the kind of lawsuits that have been levied, you know, that it stated against data centers, and that's what the county faces in the future because of the noise. How many of the people who are promoting the data centers live here which hear that noise?

HEARING MODERATOR: Angela Carlson. And I know the second meetings supposed to start at 3 o'clock. I think we've got 9 or 10 speakers, so we'll finish this up before we start the next one.

MS. CARLSON: All right. Hello,

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

everyone. As stated, my name is Angela Carlson, C-A-R-L-S-O-N. I live in Batavia, but I'm a long-time resident of Oakfield. My family still lives in Oakfield and I'm a local teacher at the Oakfield Alabama School. So, I speak for a lot of people in the area who of course cannot be here now.

So, Mark Masse. "Pursuant to General Municipal Law 859-(a), I'm ready to oppose proposed financial incentives for Project Rampart, Potentia, and Double Reed. The applicable Genesee municipal law requires GCEDC to produce a written cost-benefit analysis by the agency that identifies the extent to which project will create or retain permanent private sector jobs, the estimated value of any tax exemptions to be provided, the amount of private sector investment generated or likely to be generated by the proposed project, the contribution of the project to the state's renewable energy goals and emission reduction targets as set forth in the state energy plan adopted pursuant to Section 6104

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

of the energy law. The likelihood of accomplishing the proposed project in a timely fashion and the extent to which the proposed project will provide additional sources of revenue from municipalities, school districts, and any other public benefits that might occur as a result of the project.

In addition, the law requires the GCEDC to identify the owner-operator of the facility to the public. GCEDC has failed to produce such a cost-benefit analysis at a good time or inform the public of the data center's identity. And thus, these hearings are insufficient as a venue in which to solicit public comment.

More of Project Ramparts use of 200 megawatts of electricity per year in its onsite bulk storage of 1.5 million gallons of diesel fuel with associated risks of brown and surface water contamination raise serious concerns.

Additionally, Project Ramparts claims of no impact on wetlands and water bodies are

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

undermined by its plants to discharge stormwater directly to tributaries and wetlands, facilitated by a 7.7-acre onsite storm water pond. The creation of 20 acres of impervious surface further exasperates potential environmental consequences.

The EAF also acknowledges the presence of New York State-listed rare and threatened species, including the northern harrier and short-eared owl, making this project need even greater ecological risk.

Additionally, I'm ready to issue the following demands:

The GCEDC was properly produced and informed about the written cost-benefit analysis of Project Rampart as stipulated in the general municipal law, must widely circulate this report and must hold another round of public hearings with significant advanced notice to the public and a -- and a time that accommodates the people who are working a standard 9:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. schedule.

The GCEDC must immediately disclose the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

identity of the owners and operators of Project Rampart and the other data centers.

The GCEDC must publicly provide the completed applications required by GMU 8594 or 84. And the uniform criteria for evaluation and selection of projects required by GMU 85985.

The GCEC must ensure that JLL LLC carry out a third-party verified robust comprehensive noise study of Project Rampart, and while they publicize the results.

In all aspects of the public process, pertinent to Project Rampart and other data -- and the other data centers, GCEDC must follow CP29 environmental justice and provide enhanced public participation opportunities to the Tonawanda Seneca Nation and public at large.

To quote a certain op-ed, 'One cannot claim to care about the environment while continuing to disregard and disrespect the rights of indigenous peoples. They are on the front lines.'

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

59 Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 2 The values (inaudible) 3 industrialization, destruction that directly fuel the climate crisis we face today. 4 5 Ignoring their warnings is a great mistake. 6 They have been fighting to protect this land 7 far longer than any of us. So fellow people 8 of Oak Alabama, don't mess this up. 9 Businessmen, maybe sellouts, we are not." 10 HEARING MODERATOR: Melissa Smith. 11 Melissa, you have to keep it level. 12 MS. SMITH: Keep it level. Okay. 13 HEARING MODERATOR: You're pointing right 14 at the speakers. 15 MS. SMITH: Okay. Level with what? 16 HEARING MODERATOR: Keep it like that. 17 MS. SMITH: Oh, keep it level. Okay. Мy 18 name is Melissa Smith. I think you guys all 19 know that that's my name. I'm from the 20 Tonawanda Seneca Nation. I live right here 21 on Judge Road, right across from the -- from 22 where the STAMP is trying to build all their 23 crap. 24 First of all, I want to say that how 25 dare you come through all of these people

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

and you don't even have your people that are going to build these things lined up? How dare you? How dare you present that you know more than these companies know to present to us what to do. You know, how dare you. No respect for all these people. No respect for the nation. It's terrible. And have you ever been out to the Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge; do you guys ever go there? Because we go there a lot.

There's places for me to go and see woods and swamp and whatever, where I can get to it. You know how difficult that is for a person in a wheelchair. You need to be more closer to the Earth. You're so wrong and you're thinking that green means money, because green does not.

And I have a few suggestions for what you can do with that thing on Crosby Road. Turn it into a wildlife sanctuary like they did somewhere in New York State. It's called Cherry Creek. And they made it into a huge -- they aligned it with the Iroquois National Wildlife. You could do everything

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

and have tourism there instead of this crap that you're trying to put there. Get out there and roll on the grass once in a while. That's what your people need.

HEARING MODERATOR: Jacob Clark.

THE COURT REPORTER: Say it again, Jacob Clark.

HEARING MODERATOR: Jacob Clark.

MR. CLARK: Hello everybody. My name is Jacob Clark. I'm a registered member of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation. I come to you from East Aurora, New York, and I'm here to read on behalf of somebody who cannot attend for reasons we've previously heard. I'm going to read the letter handed to me here.

"I'm writing to express comments about the proposed financial incentives being offered by GCEDC to Project Potentia.

As a resident of Genesee County, I find it part of my civic duty to ask for clarification on the proposed STAMP Data Centers, project by Genesee County Economic Development Center, GCEDC. The data center's information seems to be

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

intentionally vague with empty promises of jobs and 'economic development.' It's clear that the lack of transparency is just another clear tactic to dissuade the public from the real potential harm to the area. There are real concerns of sound pollution, raised utilities due to increased demand, and new infrastructure that will fall squarely on the backs of local residents.

The Tonawanda Seneca Nation has clearly stated that they do not want this project next to their territory. It has impacts on their land and consideration to biodiversity. It is our responsibility as neighbors of the nation to stand with them in protecting their land as well as our own.

As residents of Genesee County, we have seen many projects come and go that have not directly benefited the residents, instead have just lined the pockets of large corporations.

I oppose the proposed incentives for Project Potentia and the development of Project Potentia by GCEDC. GCEDC's February

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3rd, 2025, public hearings are (inaudible) inadequate and illegal, constitute a violation of the public trust and manifest an utter lack of regard for the impact of data centers on Tonawanda Seneca Nation, residents of the Great Lakes bio region and the health and wellbeing of our shared environment.

GCEDC must address these failures and hold a new round of hearings. Sincerely, Gina Sheila Mano (phonetic), Batavia, New York." I yield my time.

HEARING MODERATOR: Hilka Salsbury.

MS. SALSBURY: Hi. My name is Hilka Salsbury. I'm a resident -- my name is Hilka Salsbury. I'm a resident of the town of Alabama. I pay my taxes here. I pay my water bills, which are going up. This is also the traditional lands of the Tonawanda Seneca. We are on it. These lands are unseeded, and they were taken without being ratified by Congress. I hold a deed that has Tonawanda Seneca's land outlined on my deed, as I'm sure the deed does to the

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

property that's on STAMP.

I did not -- I moved to Alabama not knowing that this STAMP works was already underway. It was done in secrecy. There was an inappropriate environmental review that I saw that was done in 2012 that did not include the Tonawanda Seneca Nation input at that time. They weren't even mentioned at all. They weren't counted as part as the local census.

There were about 900 people that live over there. Their very existence is threatened by this project. Their way of life is threatened, we are all threatened. What happens to them will happen to all of us.

We are currently undergoing a sixth mass extinction on this planet. Google it. What we're going to need in the future is clean water, and rich soil and land in which to grow organic foods. I propose that it may be a project for STAMP. But not, not, not without the consent of the Tonawanda Seneca Nation.

(Cross-talk.)

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. SALSBURY: I hope to turn the page. We all need to come together as a community. We have all suffered, the people that live here, emotionally, physically, due to the stress of this project. Please, let's rethink STAMP, cease and desist this whole project and let's move forward with a better plan.

HEARING MODERATOR: James Burnett.

MR. BURNETT: I -- my name is James Burnett. I'm from Lackawanna, New York, way over in Erie County, other side of the world.

It has come to my attention that one of the major reasons for the STAMP project is to buy Western New York votes for Governor Hochul and Senator Chuck Schumer by dumping federal and state monies into GCEDC and their business associates. Somebody's getting paid, but you're not.

The promised jobs will likely not materialize after the initial destruction and construction. This is a low economic

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

return project. I'll give you two examples.

Example one. Last week, Chinese AI lab, DeepSeek, massively undercut open AI on pricing, sending shockwaves down to Nasdaq. This is risky.

Example two. Comedian Nikki Glaser at the recent Tom Brady Roast made fun of cryptocurrency and Tom Brady's \$30 million loss with Bitcoin and then attributed "To local boy and Brady's go-to tight end, the likable (inaudible) Rob Gronkowski. We know that not real money. Even Gronk knows better." Nikki Glaser said that that's not my joke.

All right. The real money comes from careful choice of industries and careful site selection with the help of organizations like NYSERDA, which will help find appropriate brownfields for industrial parks. This was not done. NYSERDA was not consulted. There are better ways to put your people to work. You have to consult with other organizations that know where to locate things.

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

The real beauty, the draw in this area, the star of the show is the Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge. I invite you to check out this book, "Where to watch Wildlife New York Wildlife Viewing Guide," available at your public library. There's a section in this book on the Iroquois National Wildlife Reserve, our refuge listing river otters among other wildlife. I hope to come here more often and spend tourist dollars and photograph the river otters.

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds.

MR. BURNETT: Okay. 30 seconds. Finally, to the good people of Genesee County and town of Alabama, don't let STAMP rip you off and thank you by polluting your air and water. Okay. Thank you.

HEARING MODERATOR: Betty Pitcher.

MS. PITCHER: Hello everyone. My name is Betty Pitcher. It's like a baseball pitcher or the kind you pour. I live in Lancaster, New York as of last spring. For many, many years before that I lived in East Aurora.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And it was in East Aurora that I saw the article in in the paper written by Jacob Clark about the STAMP project. And I've read some more articles about this, so I have a little -- I wrote a little bit here.

The Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge and the Tonawanda setting nation must be protected. The STAMP project would do great harm to this area. It would be disastrous to the Tonawanda Seneca Nation and the Iroquois National Wildlife Refuge. STAMP's surrounded by four state and federally protected areas and would border the Tonawanda Seneca Nations' big woods.

In this area, there are wetlands, grasslands and forests, with its wildlife of birds and other animals. There is cultural and natural history and natural beauty.

Nature does not have a voice. It is up to us to be that voice, to protect this very special place by saying no to STAMP and its irreparable damage. We must be that voice to protect this natural beauty. This is what makes New York such a beautiful state."

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

Thank you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HEARING MODERATOR: Amy Khan (phonetic).

MS. KHAN: My name is Amy Khan. I live on unseated Seneca Land in Rochester, New York. And I am an active ally to the Seneca people. I'm speaking here today, and I think I might combine my comments on both the Rampart and the Potentia project since we're at past the 3 o'clock time.

I'm writing to oppose any kind of financial incentives for either of these projects. And I've been following this project since Governor Cuomo first proposed this project. And I remember conversations at that time about -- it made no sense to me to put a tech park in the middle of an area where they were expecting people to drive from Rochester and Buffalo to be employed there. Things have changed dramatically since that was first proposal. And we're now to the point where all of these hundreds of millions of my tax dollars, your tax dollars have been poured into something that is going to employ less than a hundred

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

people, if that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So, I think that some of our politicians that are still pumping money in here are being fooled as well as the public. There's been such a (inaudible) for this project from day one. There's been no attempts to be transparent. There have been no attempts really until very recently, and even now it's done begrudgingly to speak to the neighbors, the folks who live in the Tonawanda Seneca Nations who rely on their big woods.

People come from all over Haudenosaunee territory to hunt and collect medicine in the Big Woods. And the Big Woods are a threat because of now data centers going in.

If I read, and I'm hoping that there was a typo in the information, but one of these data centers, if I did my calculations right, it could be 41 acres of building that's being -- I mean, that's hard to imagine how you even hold a building up that's that big. To fill that building with machinery that's going to pump out noise

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

that's going to then disturb all those animals, to cool that building with water --

HEARING MODERATOR: 30 seconds.

MS. KHAN: -- that is then going to be discharged either into wetlands that flow into the nation or, you know, be dumped in the opposite direction and go into Oak Orchard. Both of those bodies of water are full of very sensitive animals that will not survive the pollution. So even if anyone here likes to fish, that might be threatened by these. So, there's a lot -- this is affecting many, many people. And as a taxpayer, I especially object to this use of my hard-earned money.

And I do also object to holding this on the first Monday of a month in the afternoon when so many of my friends are not able to come because they (inaudible) their job to come.

Unfortunately retired so I had the option to come here today. But many, many hardworking people whose money you are spending, were not able to come. That is a

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

72 Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025 1 violation of all of our state regulations. 2 3 So, you've got to do this -- a better job of 4 not just check marking and saying, oh, we're 5 following the law, but actually following 6 the law. It will serve your purposes better 7 as well. 8 HEARING MODERATOR: Thank you. 9 MS. KHAN: This one said Potentia at the 10 top, but you just say that it's for all three. 11 12 THE COURT REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. 13 HEARING MODERATOR: Jordan Kadish. 14 THE COURT REPORTER: Could you spell your 15 last name for me? 16 MR. KADISH: Sure. 17 THE COURT REPORTER: Okay. Thank you. MR. KADISH: Yes. Hi, my name is Jordan 18 19 Kadish, K-A-D-I-S-H. I have about 30 percent 20 (inaudible) blood in me from Bogota, 21 Colombia. But I'm not here to speak on 22 them, more specifically though about the 23 Kogi, which also are an indigenous tribe 24 from Bogota, Colombia. And they have made 25 two movies and one of their spiritual

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

leaders' sons had gone on a live webcast and spoke about the consequences of giving into the death machine of the capitalistic Healthscope, that is putting things up like big data centers and the constant need to grow as an economy, which is killing the it's dying, literally dying. planet, Because of people (inaudible) working to build these three projects.

The movies are called The Heart --Message from The Heart of the World and And they're both on YouTube, as is Aluna. the spiritual leader's son that came and talked. You can search YouTube search Golden Message of the Kogi.

And everyone's already mentioned the environmental impact of energy use and all of its impacts, the wildlife energy grid strain, air pollution, E-way's water usage, heated water discharge, danger of fires, and explosions. But there are real consequences to this -- well, I've already said -- that's all I really had to say.

HEARING MODERATOR: Jean Dixon?

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MS. DIXON: My name is Jean Dixon. I am reading a message from Virginia Maier, M-A-I-E-R from Fairport, New York. I'm going to add a couple things of my own. I'm writing to oppose the proposed financial incentives for Project Potentia. Although I'm not a resident of Genesee County, the decisions you make on this project will affect me and my children and my grandchildren through the pollution and energy use of this data center.

Scientists have been telling us for decades that our emissions of fossil fuel are fundamentally changing the climate that supports human civilization. At this point, with limited renewable energy available, any activities that seek to use immense amounts of energy, such as this data center will be contributing to this planetary crisis.

By allowing this project to go forward and even facilitating it, you are telling the children of this community that you don't care that they will have to deal with this crisis.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025

The effects of which we conceive from the devastating fires in Los Angeles, to the deadly flooding caused by Hurricane Helene, to the newly unpredictable weather patterns wreaking havoc on agriculture in your own community. These effects are only going to get -- keep getting worse unless we unite to stop emitting fossil fuels. It is even more galling that this pollution will be created by a data center, which is literally not producing anything of value except wealth for a few already wealthy individuals

Either for bitcoin mining or powering completely unnecessary AI bots. It's incredibly depressing that this project is receiving greater consideration than the literal future of the planet and of the people you and I care about.

The majority of residents in New York State voted for a constitutional amendment guaranteeing a right to clean air and water just two years ago. This project flies in the face of what the people have said they want and our responsibilities to future

generations.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Please reject any support for this project and rethink whether what is happening at STAMP really aligns with the public's desires and what I hope is your desire to make the world a better place now and in the future. Thank you.

HEARING MODERATOR: Cindy Stroud (phonetic).

MS. STROUD: Good afternoon. I enjoy the way everybody walks up here real slow to make you all wait. So, I walked really slow for you all. Just want you to know I'm from Clean Air Coalition of Western New York, and I'm here just to let you know, I oppose the proposed incentive for Project Potentia. Is that how you print it out? Okay, Potentia, and development of the Project Potentia by GCEDC. Any financial incentive for Project Double Reed would thus violate the stipulations of the general municipal law.

Project Double Reed uses -- used -- used of 250 megawatts of energy per year and consumption of 60,000 gallons of diesel fuel

	77
1	Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025
2	per year with associated emissions of 533
3	tons of CO2 per year, as well as its
4	squandering of 10,000 gallons of water
5	daily.
6	Clearly violates the state's renewable
7	energy goals and emission reduction targets.
8	We say no.
9	HEARING MODERATOR: Chris Murawski. You
10	spell your name.
11	MR. MURAWSKI: Yes, sure.
12	Hi, everyone, my name is Chris Murawski
13	M-u-R-A-W-S-K-I. First name is C-H-R-I-S.
14	Coming today with my colleague Cindy,
15	Executive Director of the Clean Air
16	Coalition of Western New York, and we work
17	with residents and workers of environmental
18	justice communities throughout our region to
19	organize and win for public health and
20	environmental justice.
21	We're also part of group Buffalo
22	(inaudible) Friends of Echo Hay way, provide
23	solidarity from non-native groups to native
24	groups in New York in Western New York.
25	On behalf of Clean Air's members and
l	

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

supporters, we write to express comments about the proposed financial incentives being offered by GCEDC to the three proposed projects and the STAMP project, project Double Reed, project Rampart and Project Potentia.

We strongly oppose these proposed financial incentives for these three projects and any further development of these projects, and we've arrived at opposition for the following reasons.

Data centers are immensely energyintensive facilities, significant demands on local infrastructure for relatively small job creation. Regulations must be put in place first to prevent stress on energy and water infrastructure as well as to prevent concerns from noise.

Before we permit these structures to go in place, we need regulations to regulate them, and we do not have them yet in New York.

Clean Air has a campaign in North Tonawanda, New York, where there is a data

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

center currently running and an old gasfired power plant. But there's welldocumented effects from noise pollution from the residents. The residents can't sleep, they're disturbing the wildlife, they're disturbing their pets. And -- so, we know that this is a big concern. And the city has actually passed a two-year moratorium on the development of any more of these types of projects because it's so bad.

So, STAMP is an extremely inappropriate site for a data center due to its remote location, lack of infrastructure, and of course, adjacency to the Seneca Tonawanda Nation and sensitive protected environmental areas.

Further, all three of these proposals include plans for emergency diesel backup generators, and greenhouse gas submissions projected into the megatons annually.

We also object to the opaque public engagement process related to the development of the site and these three proposed projects. And we ask that GCEDC

FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES (585) 343-8612

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

reject the applications of the three projects, also produce the written costbenefit analysis as stipulated in the General Municipal Law, and then widely circulate this report and hold another round of public hearings, with significant advanced notice to the public, and not a time that's during the business day 9:00 to 5:00, give folks a chance to come in the evening.

We put together all kinds of public engagement groups and we always do them in the evening because we want people to come and take part in that. We don't do it during the workday.

And there's other things in here that I don't have time to get to, but I'll hand in my letter. I appreciate the time. Thank you.

HEARING MODERATOR: Okay. With that, I think we'll close the public hearing for Project Rampart.

We'll stop video.

(Proceedings concluded.)

		81
1	Rampart, LLC Public Hearing February 3, 2025	
2	CERTIFICATE	
3		
4	I, Suzanne Saeed Tacker, do hereby certify	
5	that I have reported in voice court reporting the	
6	proceedings in the matter of the Public Hearing	
7	Pursuant to New York State Eminent Domain Procedure	
8	Law Section 203 Regarding STAMP Sewer Works	
9	Corporation aka STAMP Sewer Works, Inc., at the	
10	Alabama Volunteer Fire Department, 2230 Judge Road,	
11	Alabama, New York, on July 27, 2023.	
12		
13	That the transcript herewith is a true, accurate and	ł
14	complete record of my voice court reporting	
15	software.	
16		
17		
18		
19	Suzanne Saeed Tacker, CCR	
20	Certified Court Reporter	
21	License No. 6471-8356-4904-8576	
22		
23		
24		
25		